

We declare no competing interests.

*Nazir A Ismail, Kerrigan McCarthy, Francesca Conradie, Wendy Stevens, Norbert Ndjeka
naziri@nicd.ac.za

Centre for Tuberculosis (NAI) and Division of Public Health Surveillance and Response (KM), National Institute for Communicable Diseases, Johannesburg, South Africa; National Clinical Advisory Committee and University of Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa (FC); National Priority Programmes, National Health Laboratory Service, Johannesburg, South Africa (WS); and MDR-TB Directorate, National Department of Health, Pretoria, South Africa (NN)

- Makhado NA, Matabane E, Faccin M, et al. Outbreak of multidrug-resistant tuberculosis in South Africa undetected by WHO-endorsed commercial tests: an observational study. *Lancet Infect Dis* 2018; **18**: 1350–59.
- Ismail NA, Omar SV, Mvusi L, Madhi SA. Prevalence of drug-resistant tuberculosis in South Africa—authors' reply. *Lancet Infect Dis* 2018; **18**: 836–37.
- Zignol M, Cabibbe AM, Dean AS, et al. Genetic sequencing for surveillance of drug resistance in tuberculosis in highly endemic countries: a multi-country population-based surveillance study. *Lancet Infect Dis* 2018; **18**: 675–83.
- Omar SV, Ismail F, Joseph L, et al. Prevalence of the rifampicin resistant determinant at codon 491 in South Africa, undetected by commercial phenotypic and genotypic methods—FIDSSA 2017 Congress abstracts. *South Afr J Infect Dis* 2017; **32**: 38–119.
- National Department of Health. National tuberculosis management guidelines 2014. <http://www.nicd.ac.za/assets/files/Acrobat%20Document2.pdf> (accessed Oct 27, 2018).
- Lee RS, Radomski N, Proulx JF, et al. Population genomics of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* in the Inuit. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 2015; **112**: 13609–14.
- Dixit A, Freschi L, Vargas R, et al. Genotypic clustering does not imply recent tuberculosis transmission in a high prevalence setting: a genomic epidemiology study in Lima, Peru. *bioRxiv* 2018; published online Sept 16. DOI:10.1101/418202 (preprint).
- Ndjeka N, Schnippel K, Master I, et al. High treatment success rate for multidrug-resistant and extensively drug-resistant tuberculosis using a bedaquiline-containing treatment regimen. *Eur Respir J* 2018; published online Oct 25. DOI:10.1183/13993003.01528-2018.
- Dorman SE, Schumacher SG, Alland D, et al. Xpert MTB/RIF Ultra for detection of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* and rifampicin resistance: a prospective multicentre diagnostic accuracy study. *Lancet Infect Dis* 2018; **18**: 76–84.

Authors' reply

We thank Nazir Ismail and colleagues for sharing unpublished findings from genomic data from the South Africa tuberculosis drug-resistance survey.¹

Unlike the objective of this survey, our goal was to specifically determine whether *rpoB* Ile491Phe-bearing *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* isolates obtained from patients with multidrug-resistant (MDR) tuberculosis were misclassified as isoniazid-monoresistant by standard diagnostic algorithms, in a centre receiving samples from four South African provinces.

Samples from all patients referred to the National Health Laboratory Service—Dr George Mukhari Tertiary Laboratory over the study period were cultured, irrespective of Xpert MTB/RIF results or treatment history. We screened isolates randomly selected from 1823 isoniazid-monoresistant strains among 37 644 *M tuberculosis*-positive cultures using four techniques to detect *rpoB* Ile491Phe.

Most of the Ile491Phe mutants were found to have unique individual (albeit closely related) single-nucleotide polymorphism (SNP) profiles by deep sequencing or whole-genome sequencing, excluding duplicates or laboratory contamination. Four isolates had indistinguishable genome sequences, commonly seen in transmission networks spanning several years.^{2,3} These genomically identical isolates, like others separated only by a single SNP, were obtained within a 2-year period from different local clinics located within 20 km of one another. Such conjunction of spatiotemporal clustering and close genomic relatedness, with a rare compensatory mutation (*rpoC* Glu1033Ala) and other shared drug-resistance associated mutations, is strongly supportive of an outbreak.^{2,3} Our results delineate the minimal outbreak extent, and we therefore suggested that further studies were warranted to assess the prevalence and spread of this mutation outside of the study population.

Although we agree with Ismail and colleagues, as well as Variava and Martinson,⁴ that the association of the detected Rv0678 mutations with bedaquiline resistance awaits

formal demonstration, the observed independent emergences of different Rv0678 mutations in groups of otherwise indistinguishable genomes are very unlikely to be due to simple genetic drift. Other Rv0678 mutations are associated with resistance to bedaquiline or clofazimine.^{5,6} Our temporal reconstruction suggests that such mutations arose around the year 2015, 2 years after the start of the bedaquiline clinical access programme, compatible with a link with bedaquiline use.

It is unfortunate that not all resistance mutations in *M tuberculosis* are picked up by rapid tests in use, and the *rpoB* Ile491Phe mutation is not the only resistance mutation missed. Moreover, such undetected mutants are not unique to South Africa.⁷ Similarly to treatment regimens, diagnostic tests can drive amplification and spread of resistance. As concluded by Variava and Martinson,⁴ better tests are needed to cope with the global problem of MDR tuberculosis.

PS is a consultant for Genoscreen. All other authors declare no competing interests.

Ndivhuho A Makhado,
Maphoshane Nchabeleng,
Philip Supply, Bouke C de Jong,
*Emmanuel André
emmanuel.andre@uzleuven.be

Department of Medical Microbiology, National Health Laboratory Service—Dr George Mukhari Tertiary Laboratory, Pretoria, South Africa (NAM, MN); Department of Microbiological Pathology, Sefako Makgatho Health Sciences University, Pretoria, South Africa (NAM, MN); Mycobacteriology Unit, Department of Biomedical Sciences, Institute of Tropical Medicine, Antwerp, Belgium (NAM); Global Health Institute, University of Antwerp, Belgium (NAM); Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique, Lille, France (PS); Institut National de la Santé et de la Recherche Médicale, Lille, France (PS); Centre Hospitalier Universitaire de Lille, Lille, France (PS); University of Lille, Lille, France (PS); U1019, UMR 8204, Centre for Infection and Immunity of Lille, Institut Pasteur de Lille, France (PS); Mycobacteriology Unit, Department of Biomedical Sciences, Institute of Tropical Medicine, Antwerp, Belgium (BCdJ); and Laboratory of Clinical Bacteriology and Mycology, Department of Microbiology and Immunology, KU Leuven, Leuven 3000, Belgium (EA)

- Ismail NA, Mvusi L, Nannoo A, et al. Prevalence of drug-resistant tuberculosis and imputed burden in South Africa: a national and sub-national cross-sectional survey. *Lancet Infect Dis* 2018; **18**: 779–87.



Published Online
December 6, 2018
[http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S1473-3099\(18\)30738-2](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S1473-3099(18)30738-2)

- 2 Roetzer A, Diel R, Kohl TA, et al. Whole genome sequencing versus traditional genotyping for investigation of a *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* outbreak: a longitudinal molecular epidemiological study. *PLoS Med* 2013; **10**: e1001387.
- 3 Walker TM, Ip CL, Harrell RH, et al. Whole-genome sequencing to delineate *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* outbreaks: a retrospective observational study. *Lancet Infect Dis* 2013; **13**: 137–46.
- 4 Variava E, Martinson N. Occult rifampicin-resistant tuberculosis: better assays are needed. *Lancet Infect Dis* 2018; published online Oct 17. [http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S1473-3099\(18\)30550-4](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S1473-3099(18)30550-4).
- 5 Bloemberg GV, Keller PM, Stucki D, et al. Acquired resistance to bedaquiline and delamanid in therapy for tuberculosis. *N Engl J Med* 2015; **373**: 1986–88.
- 6 Hartkoorn RC, Uplekar S, Cole ST. Cross-resistance between clofazimine and bedaquiline through upregulation of MmpL5 in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 2014; **58**: 2979–81.
- 7 Manson AL, Cohen KA, Abeel T, et al. Genomic analysis of globally diverse *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* strains provides insights into the emergence and spread of multidrug resistance. *Nat Genet* 2017; **49**: 395–402.