



ELSEVIER

Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

## International Journal of Infectious Diseases

journal homepage: [www.elsevier.com/locate/ijid](http://www.elsevier.com/locate/ijid)INTERNATIONAL  
SOCIETY  
FOR INFECTIOUS  
DISEASES

## Letter to the Editor

**Efficacy and safety of Ergoferon versus oseltamivir: Reply to the Letter to the Editor**

In a paper published in 2016, we presented the results of a randomized controlled clinical trial conducted during 2011–2014. The study was based on a non-inferiority (NI) design, since the objective was to compare the efficacy and safety of Ergoferon with oseltamivir for the treatment of seasonal influenza in adult outpatients. The study objective as well as the design are very clearly described in the paper, in accordance with current guidelines for NI clinical trials to compare the efficacy of a new drug with an active control ([Guidance for Industry, 2016](#); [ICH Harmonised Tripartite Guideline, 2019a,b](#)).

The goal of the study was to show that the difference between the new treatment (Ergoferon) and the active control treatment (oseltamivir) is small enough to allow the known effectiveness of the active control, based on its performance in past studies and the assumed effectiveness of the active control in the current study, to support the conclusion that the new test drug (Ergoferon) is also effective ([Guidance for Industry, 2016](#); [ICH Harmonised Tripartite Guideline, 2019a,b](#)). In other words, the goal was to demonstrate that the test drug (Ergoferon) has an effect by showing that its effect is sufficiently close to the effect of an active control (oseltamivir). There was no placebo arm in that study, which is in accordance with NI protocols. In our NI study, the oseltamivir proved effective against seasonal influenza when given within 48 h after the onset of symptoms ([Dobson et al., 2015](#); [Jefferson et al., 2009](#); [Treanor et al., 2000](#); [Nicholson et al., 2000](#)). Thus, the design of the study was a NI study in compliance with the International Council for Harmonisation of Technical Requirements for Pharmaceuticals for Human Use (ICH) guidelines ([ICH Harmonised Tripartite Guideline, 2019a,b](#)).

According to ICH E9 (“Statistical Principles for Clinical Trials” guideline) ([ICH Harmonised Tripartite Guideline, 2019b](#)), “only the lower margin is needed for the active control NI trial” and “statistical analysis is generally based on the use of confidence intervals”. The NI margin used in the study was 20%. The pre-specified margin was selected to be lower in magnitude than the effect of the control drug over the placebo ([ICH Harmonised Tripartite Guideline, 2019a](#)). In the study by [Treanor et al. \(2000\)](#), the effect of oseltamivir versus placebo is stated as follows: “The percentage of subjects with fever at 24 h was 39% in the placebo group, compared with 21% in the 150-mg group (18% difference; 95% CI 6–29%)”. Taking into consideration that confidence intervals for proportion differences between arms were presented in the paper (in Table 2), the conclusion about the NI of the studied drug as compared to the control is correct.

So, the statements of the authors of the Letter about “lacking a control group” and “study is deeply flawed” are not correct.

The superiority of Ergoferon over placebo in the treatment of patients with influenza and other acute respiratory viral infections has been shown previously ([Anon, 2019a](#); [Verevshikov et al., 2011](#); [Kostinov, 2011](#); [Geppe et al., 2014](#); [Zaplatnikov et al., 2015](#)) and we wrote about this fact in the Introduction section. In the Discussion section, we highlighted the limitations that could be a source of bias, including the open-label trial design and the absence of a placebo group and an untreated group.

The active pharmaceutical ingredients of Ergoferon are released-active forms of the antibodies to interferon gamma (IFN- $\gamma$ ), antibodies to histamine, and antibodies to the CD4 receptor produced on the basis of the patented biotechnological platform. In the Treatment section, we emphasized that Ergoferon is crucially different from homeopathic therapy, so we maintain that Ergoferon is not a homeopathic drug. There is nothing stated in the Guide for Authors for the *International Journal of Infectious Diseases* regarding any possible inappropriate technology that cannot be used for the manufacture or production of the investigational drugs.

Regarding the concern itself, it is highly important to note that Ergoferon is registered in the country of origin (i.e., the Russian Federation) as the conventional drug (registration number JICP-007362/10 dated July 29, 2010). All of the manufacturing and quality control steps for Ergoferon have been validated and approved by the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation (regulatory agency). The primary substances of the drug are rabbit polyclonal antibodies produced in the UK (Pentlands Science Park, Bush Loan, Penicuik, Midlothian, EH26 0PZ, UK) in accordance with GMP requirements. The active pharmaceutical ingredients (released-active dilutions of antibodies) are produced by GMP manufacturing facilities in Russia. Clinical studies on Ergoferon ([Anon, 2019b,c](#); [Sel'kova et al., 2019](#); [Geppe et al., 2019](#); [Kondyurina et al., 2016a,b](#)), as well as other released-active drugs ([Anon, 2019d,e](#)), have been conducted in accordance with GCP and they are controlled by the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation. Detailed information about the drug Ergoferon is available on the official website of the Ministry of Health ([Anon, 2019f](#)).

The fact that the drugs based on released-active antibodies are not homeopathic was supported by experts from the US Food and Drug Administration (FDA) during the Critical Path Innovation Meeting (CPIM) on July 8, 2016 ([Anon, 2019g](#)). The participants at the meeting were FDA experts from the following offices of the Center for Drug Evaluation and Research: Office of the Center Director, Professional Affairs and Stakeholder Engagement Staff, Office of Translational Sciences (OTS) Immediate Office, OTS Office of Clinical Pharmacology, Office of Regulatory Policy, Office of Pediatric Therapeutics, Office of Pharmaceutical Quality, Office of Policy for Pharmaceutical Quality. As a result of the CPIM, the FDA experts concluded that *Materia Medica* drugs should be proceeded for registration using a standard regulatory approach with some modifications in the relevant divisions (Division of Antiviral

Products; Division of Neurology Products; Division of Metabolism and Endocrinology Products).

Moreover, this unambiguous conclusion was also supported earlier by the Biological Medicines Section experts of the Medicines and Healthcare Products Regulatory Agency (MHRA) (Anon, 2019h) at the Scientific Advice Meeting in 2015. The experts were provided with a dossier on Anaferon (another drug produced using the same technology as was used for Ergoferon, but only antibodies to IFN- $\gamma$  were used as the starting substance). After careful considering of the dossier, the MHRA experts came to the following conclusion (cited from document Ref. 1029/Anaferon dated September 28, 2015): “Anaferon is considered to be a biological drug product and eligible for a full Marketing Authorization. As it is an antiviral drug product, the Centralized procedure is the only regulatory route available for Anaferon”.

Thus, experts from the competent regulatory agencies have confirmed that the drug is non-homeopathic. We quote the conclusions of the FDA (Memorandum of the CPIM in July 8, 2016) and MHRA experts because these documents are not publicly available. It is a well-known fact that a drug-maker receives these documents during the research and development stage of a new drug.

The drug is a biotechnological product, unlike homeopathic remedies. Unlike homeopathy, the efficacy and mechanism of action of our drugs have been proved in preclinical studies conducted in contract research organizations and public research institutions in Russia, France, the UK, Belgium, Germany, the Netherlands, Norway, the USA, etc., under the supervision of globally recognized scientific opinion leaders (Kheyfets et al., 2011; Gorbunov et al., 2015a,b; Ganina et al., 2016; Emelianova et al., 2016; Khakimova et al., 2016; Emel'yanova et al., 2017; Kanareikina et al., 2019).

The effect of released-active antibodies has been shown to be strictly specific, while the trigger mechanism of their effect lies in the modification of conformational characteristics of the target molecule. For instance, investigations of released-active antibodies to IFN- $\gamma$  using nuclear magnetic resonance spectroscopy demonstrated their modifying effect on the conformational characteristics of the IFN- $\gamma$  molecule, causing a shift in the equilibrium between the monomer and dimer forms of this cytokine (transformation from inactive into the active form of the protein). Conformational changes were observed in amino acid residues of the C-terminal fragment of the IFN- $\gamma$  molecule and amino acid residues involved in the formation of this cytokine dimer (Epstein, 2013, 2018). Consequently, the modified nature of the ligand–receptor interaction of the IFN- $\gamma$  with its receptor was observed as being the trigger mechanism of the effect of released-active antibodies to IFN- $\gamma$ .

## Funding

None.

## Ethical approval

Not required.

## Conflict of interest

Elena Andrianova and Mikhail Putilovskiy are employees of the OOO “NPF “MATERIA MEDICA HOLDING”.

## References

- Anon. <https://grls.rosminzdrav.ru/CIPermissionMini.aspx?CIStatement-UID=91d9d67d-b5d8-4bf4-864f-93f69b2a8a77&CIPermUID=99CF17C6-6A27-44F9-B599-D072AEA00F34>. 2019a [Accessed 13 September 2019].
- Anon. <https://clinicaltrials.gov/ct2/results?cond=&term=Ergoferon&cntry=&state=&city=&dist>. 2019b [Accessed 13 September 2019].
- Anon. [https://grls.rosminzdrav.ru/CIPermissionReg.aspx?PermYear=0&DateBeg=&DateEnd=&DateInc=&NumInc=&RegNm=&Statement=&Protocol=&Qualifier=&ProtoNum=&idCIStatementCh=&CIPhase=&RangeOfApp=&Torg=&d0ad&d1%80&d0b3&d0be&d1%84&d0b5&d1%80&d0be&d0bd&LFdos=&Producer=&Researcher=&sponsorCountry=&MedBaseCount=&CIType=&PatientCount=&OrgDocOut=2&Status=1%2c2%2c3%2c4&NotInReg=0&All=0&PageSize=8&order=date\\_perm&orderType=desc&pagenum=1](https://grls.rosminzdrav.ru/CIPermissionReg.aspx?PermYear=0&DateBeg=&DateEnd=&DateInc=&NumInc=&RegNm=&Statement=&Protocol=&Qualifier=&ProtoNum=&idCIStatementCh=&CIPhase=&RangeOfApp=&Torg=&d0ad&d1%80&d0b3&d0be&d1%84&d0b5&d1%80&d0be&d0bd&LFdos=&Producer=&Researcher=&sponsorCountry=&MedBaseCount=&CIType=&PatientCount=&OrgDocOut=2&Status=1%2c2%2c3%2c4&NotInReg=0&All=0&PageSize=8&order=date_perm&orderType=desc&pagenum=1). 2019c [Accessed 13 September 2019].
- Anon. <https://clinicaltrials.gov/ct2/results?cond=&term=Materia+Medica+Holding&cntry=&state=&city=&dist>. 2019d [Accessed 13 September 2019].
- Anon. [https://grls.rosminzdrav.ru/CIPermissionReg.aspx?PermYear=0&DateBeg=&DateEnd=&DateInc=&NumInc=&RegNm=&Statement=&Protocol=&Qualifier=&ProtoNum=&idCIStatementCh=&CIPhase=&RangeOfApp=&Torg=&LFdos=&Producer=&d09c&d0b0&d1%82&d0b5&d1%80&d0b8&d0b0+&d09c&d0b5&d0b4&d0b8&d0ba&d0b0+&d0a5&d0be&d0bb&d0b4&d0b8&d0bd&d0b3&Researcher=&sponsorCountry=&MedBaseCount=&CIType=&PatientCount=&OrgDocOut=2&Status=1%2c2%2c3%2c4&NotInReg=0&All=0&PageSize=8&order=date\\_perm&orderType=desc&pageNum=1](https://grls.rosminzdrav.ru/CIPermissionReg.aspx?PermYear=0&DateBeg=&DateEnd=&DateInc=&NumInc=&RegNm=&Statement=&Protocol=&Qualifier=&ProtoNum=&idCIStatementCh=&CIPhase=&RangeOfApp=&Torg=&LFdos=&Producer=&d09c&d0b0&d1%82&d0b5&d1%80&d0b8&d0b0+&d09c&d0b5&d0b4&d0b8&d0ba&d0b0+&d0a5&d0be&d0bb&d0b4&d0b8&d0bd&d0b3&Researcher=&sponsorCountry=&MedBaseCount=&CIType=&PatientCount=&OrgDocOut=2&Status=1%2c2%2c3%2c4&NotInReg=0&All=0&PageSize=8&order=date_perm&orderType=desc&pageNum=1). 2019e [Accessed 13 September 2019].
- Anon. [https://grls.rosminzdrav.ru/Grls\\_View\\_v2.aspx?routingGuid=b2d7cb5f-1a1e-434d-8d8d-e3dab8c030c&f](https://grls.rosminzdrav.ru/Grls_View_v2.aspx?routingGuid=b2d7cb5f-1a1e-434d-8d8d-e3dab8c030c&f). 2019f [Accessed 13 September 2019].
- Anon. <https://www.fda.gov/drugs/new-drugs-fda-cders-new-molecular-entities-and-new-therapeutic-biological-products/critical-path-innovation-meeting-cpim-topics-held-date>. 2019g [Accessed 13 September 2019].
- Anon. <https://www.gov.uk/government/organisations/medicines-and-healthcare-products-regulatory-agency>. 2019h [Accessed 13 September 2019].
- Dobson J, Whitley RJ, Pocock S, Monto AS. Oseltamivir treatment for influenza in adults: a meta-analysis of randomised controlled trials. *Lancet* 2015;385:1729–37. doi:[http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736\(14\)62449-1](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(14)62449-1).
- Emel'yanova AG, Grechenko VV, Petrova NV, Shilovskii IP, Gorbunov EA, Tarasov SA, et al. Effects of release-active antibodies to CD4 receptor on the level of Ickinase in cultured mononuclear cells from human peripheral blood. *Bull Exp Biol Med* 2017;162(January (3)):323–6. doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10517-017-3606-4>.
- Emelianova AG, Shilovskii IP, Sundukova MS, Khaitov MR, Epshtein OI. Antiviral activity of Ergoferon against group A rotavirus. *Bull Exp Biol Med* 2016;161 (October (6)):806–7. doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10517-016-3516-x>.
- Epstein OI. The phenomenon of release activity and the hypothesis of “spatial” homeostasis. *Uspekhi Fiziol Nauk* 2013;44:54–76.
- Epstein O. The spatial homeostasis hypothesis. *Symmetry* 2018;10:103. doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.3390/sym10040103>.
- Ganina KK, Dugina YL, Zhavbert ES, Ertuzun IA, Epstein OI, Mukhin VN, et al. Antiamnesic effects divaza and its component model  $\beta$ -amyloid amnesia. *Zh Nevrol Psikhiatr Im S S Korsakova* 2016;116(9)69–74. doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.17116/jnevro20161169169-74> [in Russian].
- Geppe NA, Kondiurina EG, Galustian AN, Pak TE, Bal'tserovich NB, Zhiglinskaya OV, et al. Ergoferon liquid dosage form – efficacious and safe treatment for childhood acute respiratory infections. Interim outcomes of a multi-center, randomized, double-blind, placebo-controlled clinical trial [In Russian]. *Antibiot Khimioter* 2014;59:8–16. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/25552038>.
- Geppe NA, Kondyurin EG, Melnikov IM, Sabitov AU, Perminova OA, Galustyan AN, et al. Release-active antiviral drug Ergoferon in the treatment of acute respiratory infections in children. Efficacy of Ergoferon liquid dosage form: results from a randomized, double-blind, placebo-controlled clinical study. *Pediatrics* 2019;98(1)87–94. [In Russian] ISSN 1990-2182 <https://pediatria-journal.ru/archive?show=368&section=5434>.
- Gorbunov EA, Nicoll J, Myslivets AA, Kachaeva EV, Tarasov SA. Subetta enhances sensitivity of human muscle cells to insulin. *Bull Exp Biol Med* 2015a;159 (August (4)):463–5. doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10517-015-2992-8>.
- Gorbunov EA, Nicoll J, Kachaeva EV, Tarasov SA, Epstein OI. Subetta increases phosphorylation of insulin receptor  $\beta$ -subunit alone and in the presence of insulin. *Nutr Diabetes* 2015b;5(July):e169. doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/nutd.2015.20>.
- Guidance for Industry. Non-inferiority clinical trials to establish effectiveness. November. Available at: <http://www.fda.gov/downloads/Drugs/Guidances/UCM202140.pdf>. [Accessed 27 August 2019]. Previous version: guidance for industry non-inferiority clinical trials. U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Food and Drug Administration, Center for Drug Evaluation and Research, Center for Biologics Evaluation and Research; March 2010. Available at: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Food and Drug Administration, Center for Drug Evaluation and Research, Center for Biologics Evaluation and Research; 2016. . . [Accessed 4 July 2016] <http://www.fda.gov/downloads/Drugs/Guidances/UCM202140.pdf>.
- ICH Harmonised Tripartite Guideline. Choice of control group and related issues in clinical trials. E10. Current Step 4 version dated 20 July 2000. 2019 Available at [https://www.ich.org/fileadmin/Public\\_Web\\_Site/ICH\\_Products/Guidelines/Efficacy/E10/Step4/E10\\_Guideline.pdf](https://www.ich.org/fileadmin/Public_Web_Site/ICH_Products/Guidelines/Efficacy/E10/Step4/E10_Guideline.pdf). [Accessed 28 August 2019].
- ICH Harmonised Tripartite Guideline. Statistical principles for clinical trials. E9. Current Step 4 version dated 5 February 1998. 2019 Available at: [https://www.ich.org/fileadmin/Public\\_Web\\_Site/ICH\\_Products/Guidelines/Efficacy/E9/Step4/E9\\_Guideline.pdf](https://www.ich.org/fileadmin/Public_Web_Site/ICH_Products/Guidelines/Efficacy/E9/Step4/E9_Guideline.pdf). [Accessed 28 August 2019].
- Jefferson T, Jones M, Doshi P, Del Mar C. Neuraminidase inhibitors for preventing and treating influenza in healthy adults: systematic review and meta-analysis. *BMJ* 2009;339(December):b5106. doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.1136/bmj.b5106>.Review.

- Kanareikina MA, Alinkina ES, Petrova AO, Emel'yanova AG, Gorbunov EA, Tarasov SA. Ergoferon increases IL-2 production by activated lymphocytes. *Bull Exp Biol Med* 2019;166(April (6)):744–6, doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10517-019-04431-1>.
- Khakimova GR, Voronina TA, Dugina YL, Ertuzun IA, Epshtein OI. Pharmacological effects of anti-S 100 in release-active form and mechanisms of their realization. *Zh Nevrol Psikhiatr Im S S Korsakova* 2016;116(4)100–13, doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.17116/jnevro201611641100-113> [in Russian].
- Kheyfets IA, Voronina TA, Dugina JL, Molodavkin GM, Sergeeva SA. Anxiolytic activity of tenoten and diazepam depends on conditions in Vogel conflict test. *Bull Exp Biol Med* 2011;151(July (3))336–9, doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10517-011-1324-x> [English, Russian].
- Kondyurina EG, Tyuleneva IO, Burtseva EI, Trushakova SV, Mukasheva EA, Vinogradova AA, et al. Evaluating changes in the clinical presentation of acute obstructive bronchitis in preschool children using antiviral therapy. *Antibiot Khimioter* 2016a;61(9–10):33–43. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/29539249>.
- Kondyurina EG, Zaplatnikov AL, Yelkina TN, Burtseva EI, Gribanova OA, Pirozhkova NI, et al. Comprehensive evaluation of several treatment combinations used to manage acute respiratory infections in routine pediatric practice. *Antibiot Khimioter* 2016b;61(5–6)8–20. [Article in English, Russian] <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/29537736>.
- Kostinov MP. New drug for the treatment of influenza and acute respiratory viral infections [In Russian]. *Infect Dis* 2011;9:29–34. [http://con-med.ru/upload/iblock/05f/2011-kostinov\\_ergo.pdf](http://con-med.ru/upload/iblock/05f/2011-kostinov_ergo.pdf).
- Nicholson KG, Aoki FY, Osterhaus AD, Trottier S, Carewicz O, Mercier CH, et al. Efficacy and safety of oseltamivir in treatment of acute influenza: a randomised controlled trial. *Neuraminidase Inhibitor Flu Treatment Investigator Group. Lancet* 2000;355:1845–50, doi:[http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736\(00\)02288-1](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(00)02288-1).
- Sel'kova EP, Kostinov MP, Bart BY, Aver'yanov AV, Petrov DV. Results of a randomized, double-blind, placebo-controlled clinical trial in adult patients with acute respiratory viral infection. *Russ Pulmonol* 2019;29(3)302–10, doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.18093/0869-0189-2019-29-3-302-310> [In Russ.].
- Treanor JJ, Hayden FG, Vrooman PS, Barbarash R, Bettis R, Riff D, et al. Efficacy and safety of the oral neuraminidase inhibitor oseltamivir in treating acute influenza. A randomized controlled trial. *JAMA* 2000;283(8):1016–24, doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.1001/jama.283.8.1016>.
- Verevshchikov VK, Borzunov VM, Shemiakina EK. Ergoferon and improvement of etiopathogenetic therapy of influenza and acute respiratory viral infection in adults [In Russian]. *Antibiot Khimioter* 2011;56:23. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/22586900>.
- Zaplatnikov AL, Kondyurina EG, Elkina TN, Gribanova OA, Pirozhkova NI, Mingalimova GA, Tyuleneva IO. The use of different schemes of antiviral therapy of acute respiratory viral infection in children. *Child Infect* 2015;14(3)34–42, doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.22627/2072-8107-2015-14-3-34-42> [In Russian].

Elena Andrianova\*

Mikhail Putilovskiy

Research and Development Department, *Materia Medica Holding*,  
Moscow, Russian Federation, Russia

\* Corresponding author at: Research and Development Department, *Materia Medica Holding*, 9, 3rd Samotyochny per., 127473, Moscow, Russian Federation, Russia  
E-mail address: [AndrianovaEN@materiamedica.ru](mailto:AndrianovaEN@materiamedica.ru) (E. Andrianova).

Corresponding Editor: Eskild Petersen, Aarhus, Denmark

Received 29 August 2019